

Roma, 16 novembre 2023

Egregio dott. SIGFRIDO RANUCCI Capo Redattore redazione REPORT

## OGGETTO: Smentita servizio del 12 novembre "Il Mondo delle Puff"

Gentile Redazione di Report,

in riferimento al servizio "Il Mondo delle Puff", andato in onda come anteprima in apertura della puntata del 12 novembre c.m., firmato da Antonella Cignarale, come ANAFE Confindustria – Associazione Nazionale Produttori Fumo Elettronico, ci corre l'obbligo di dover precisare alcuni passaggi nonché smentirne categoricamente altri.

È indispensabile evitare che si continui a generare pericolosa confusione sul settore del fumo elettronico, a detrimento di una corretta informazione pubblica e della salute dei cittadini. Sono infatti ormai **migliaia in tutto il mondo gli studi scientifici indipendenti che dimostrano come le e-cig riducano la tossicità di almeno il 95% rispetto alle sigarette tradizionali**. Tra questi basterebbe anche solo citare quello svolto dalla MHRA (Medicines and Healthcare products Regulatory Agency), ossia l'agenzia del dipartimento del Ministero della Salute Inglese che proprio sulle sigarette elettroniche ha basato la propria politica nazionale di lotta al tabagismo, riducendo i fumatori dal 22% al 12% negli ultimi 10 anni. Mentre in Italia la percentuale è stabile da anni al 23%. QUI

A ciò si può aggiungere l'ultima revisione della Cochrane\*, organismo che ha analizzato 332 studi di lungo periodo su un totale di 157.179 fumatori adulti, e che – tra le tante cose a favore del fumo elettronico – a settembre di quest'anno ha sottolineato come nel processo di cessazione dal fumo la sigaretta elettronica si sia rivelata, negli anni, ben più efficace di sostanze farmacologiche quali vareniclina e citisina. QUI

Alleghiamo una selezione di un centinaio di Studi indipendenti.

È dunque assolutamente falso e antiscientifico dichiarare che non si conoscono gli effetti dei liquidi da inalazione e dei loro aromi, i quali - lungi dal dovere essere classificati come pericolosi e trattati con sospetto - sono invero l'elemento che consente a un fumatore adulto di aumentare la ricevibilità del prodotto ai fini della cessazione e della riduzione del rischio.



Non si può neanche tacere (come fa il servizio) che esista in Italia una stringente normativa che regolamenta le e-cig, i loro liquidi e la loro commercializzazione. La legge prevede (art. 21 D.Lgs. 6/2016) che sei (6) mesi prima dell'immissione in commercio, il produttore debba inviare al Ministero della Salute l'elenco di tutti gli ingredienti, i dati tossicologici e sulle emissioni, nonché le informazioni sulle dosi e sull'assorbimento di nicotina. Solo successivamente il Ministero ne consente la commercializzazione. QUI

Rispetto alle analisi dei liquidi da voi svolte, intanto supponiamo che abbiano riguardato prodotti legali, acquistabili tramite canali autorizzati, e poi auspichiamo che nel servizio che andrà in onda siano presenti specifici raffronti per non generare allarmismi. Infatti, è necessario precisare che i livelli di concentrazione dei metalli pesanti (milionesimi di grammo per litro) contenuti nei liquidi delle sigarette elettroniche autorizzate, a cui voi fate riferimento, sono pari circa a quelli presenti nell'acqua. Con la differenza che se la dose giornaliera di acqua raccomandata è di 2 litri, la stessa dose di liquido da svapo è assunta - forse - in due anni.

Per quanto concerne i prodotti illegali, proprio come alcuni di quelli mostrati nel servizio (ad esempio quelli con le luci colorate, categoricamente vietate dalla normativa), non si può tacere che ANAFE abbia sempre dimostrato di essere in prima linea per la lotta al contrabbando - attraverso contatti costanti con le forze dell'ordine che si sostanziano in centinaia di segnalazioni alla Guardia di Finanza e all'Agenzia dei Monopoli – oltre a essere da sempre impegnata per contrastare la vendita delle e-cig ai minori, tanto da aver siglato già nel 2020 un protocollo di intesa con il MOIGE (Movimento Italiano Genitori).

Una considerazione in chiusura: sappiamo già che il Dott. Ranucci commenterà questa lettera con una delle sue classiche espressioni: "tutte queste cose l'Associazione avrebbe potuto dircele nell'intervista che invece non ci è stata concessa". Ebbene ciò è stato fatto proprio con la piena consapevolezza che il servizio e la giornalista, lungi dal voler realmente approfondire il complesso mercato del fumo elettronico, avessero già raggiunto precise conclusioni e necessitassero solo di spezzoni di intervista per giustificare e rendere credibili le proprie erronee convinzioni. Nell'interesse di chi e che cosa, questo non si sa.

Vi chiediamo quindi di dare lettura durante la trasmissione di questa comunicazione che rappresenta la nostra posizione su quanto finora trasmesso e riservandoci le ulteriori azioni solo dopo aver visionato il servizio completo.

Cordiali saluti.

Il Presidente Umberto Roccatti

\*Accreditato network internazionale indipendente e no-profit nato con lo scopo di raccogliere e sintetizzare evidenze scientifiche accurate e aggiornate sugli effetti degli interventi sanitari.

# List of studies for the WHO

### 1. Harm Reduction

#### Imperial College 2014

Result: E-cigarettes are 96 percent less likely to cause damage than tobacco cigarettes.

#### • Cochrane 2014

Result: E-cigarettes appear to help smokers who are unable to quit completely reduce their cigarette consumption compared to placebo e-cigarettes and nicotine patches.

#### • Public Health England 2015

Result: E-cigarettes are around 95% safer than smoked tobacco and can help smokers quit smoking.

- <u>Royal Society for Public Health (RSPH) 2015 Result</u>
  Result: Electronic cigarettes contain nicotine but not the harmful substances found in
- Royal College of Physicians 2016

Result: The health risk from long-term inhalation of vapor from e-cigarettes available today should be no more than 5% of the harm from tobacco smoke.

• University of St. Andrews 2017

Result: Optimal combinations of device settings, liquid composition and vapor behavior typically result in e-cigarette emissions with a much lower carcinogenic potency than tobacco smoke.

#### • Tobacco Control 2018

Result: 99.6 percent lower cancer risk- The lifetime risk of developing cancer with ecigarettes is only 0.4 percent of the risk with tobacco cigarettes.

• <u>University of Dundee 2019</u>

Result: Those subjects who switched from tobacco cigarettes to e-cigarettes achieved significant improvements in vascular health in terms of endothelial function and arterial stiffness.

• University of Lille 2020

Result: E-cigarettes produce 98 percent less formaldehyde and 99.97 percent less carbonyl compounds compared to tobacco cigarettes.

- <u>Brown University Providence 2020</u> Result: Exclusive use of e-cigarettes leads to a reduction in respiratory symptoms compared to smoking tobacco.
- Int.J.Environ.Res. Public Health 2020 17 Result: The use of a large number of e-cigarettes does not lead to an increased intake of metals.
- <u>UK COT 2020 Report</u>
  Quote: "In considering the comparison of E(N)NDS use with CC smoking, the Committee concluded that the relative risk of adverse health effects would be expected to be substantially lower from E(N)NDS."

#### <u>Cochrane Review 2020</u>

Result: E-cigarettes are 70 percent more effective at quitting smoking than nicotine replacement products.

#### • Cancer Research UK 2021

Quote: "All this evidence is why at Cancer Research UK, we recommend people who smoke consider using e-cigarettes as an option to help them quit."

#### Mayo Clinic USA 2021

Result: Smokers and vapers contract Covid-19 no more frequently than non-smokers and non-vapers.

#### • FDA/CDC Study 2021

Quote: "Exclusive e-cigarette users have biomarker concentrations that are similar to those of former smokers who do not currently use tobacco."

 <u>AJPM Study 2021 Results</u> Result: There is no reliable evidence that e-cigarette use is

Result: There is no reliable evidence that e-cigarette use is associated with heart attack in users who have never smoked.

#### Polosa study August 2021

Result: Former smokers who only use e-cigarettes have similar bronchial values to neversmokers and former smokers.

#### • French National Cancer Institute 2021

Quote: "The electronic cigarette can be a tool to quit smoking. On its own, and not in conjunction with traditional cigarettes, it helps reduce the risks associated with smoking."

• <u>University of Valencia 2021</u> Quote: "Based on the studies carried out so far, it seems that e-cigarette consumption is less toxic than tobacco smoking."

### JAMA Network 2022

Result: "This national cohort study provides evidence on the potential harm reduction associated with transitioning from exclusive cigarette use or dual use to exclusive e-cigarette use."

- <u>University of Washington 2022</u>
  Result: "Smokers who opt to vape may have more opportunities for healthy engagement."
- <u>Nicotine & Tobacco Research 2022</u> Result: "Exclusive use of e-cigarettes was largely not associated with functionally-important respiratory symptoms and risks associated with their use was significantly lower than for cigarettes."

## 2. Quit smoking with e-cigarettes

### Onassis Surgery Center 2016

Result: Altogether, more than 6 million Europeans have quit tobacco with e-cigarettes. In Germany, the e-cigarette is the most widely used method for smoking cessation.

New England Journal of Medicine 2019

Result: E-cigarettes are twice as successful in quitting smoking as nicotine replacement products.

- <u>NGO Action on Smoking and Health (ASH), 2019</u> Result: 54 percent of the 3.6 million British vapers are now tobacco-free thanks to ecigarettes.
- Santé publique France 2019

Result: According to the French health authority, 700,000 French people have quit smoking thanks to the e-cigarette.

- <u>Nicotine & Tobacco Research 2019</u>
  Result: E-cigarettes effectively support quitting tobacco and reducing tobacco consumption. 25 percent success rate for vapers after three months.
- <u>DEBRA Study 2020</u>
  Quote: "The most commonly used form of support was the electronic cigarette (10.2 percent)."
- <u>Schweizer Suchthilfe Ost 2020</u> Result: "Smokers who wanted to quit smoking have a success rate of 17.5 percent with the ecigarette."
- <u>University of Montreal 2020</u> Result: Success rate in quitting smoking with e-cigarette: 21.9 percent.
- <u>School of Public Health (Michigan) 2020</u> Quote: "357 (99%) yield positive estimates of life-years saved (LYS) due to vaping by 2100, from 143 000 to 65 million. Most scenarios result in millions of individuals quitting smoking due to vaping. On average, vaping-induced quitters gain an extra 1.2–2.0 years of life compared to smokers who quit without vaping."
- Medical University of Vienna 2020

Quote: "EC users showed a 2.04 times higher proportion of abstinent smokers in comparison with participants solely receiving counseling."

• Nicotine Tobacco Research 2020

Result: Smokers who used e-cigarettes daily were 2-4 times more likely to quit short-term and long-term than smokers who did not use e-cigarettes.

- <u>University Queensland 2021</u>
  Quote: "Participants randomised to receive nicotine e-cigarettes were 49% more likely to remain abstinent from smoking than those who received NRTs."
- University of Virginia and Hershey 2021

Result: E-cigarettes provide significant reductions in tobacco-related toxins, such as lower exhaled carbon monoxide levels.

• University of Leuven, Belgium 2021

Quote: "People who smoke and choose e-cigarettes in the context of smoking cessation treatment by tobacco counselors show similar if not higher smoking cessation rates compared to those choosing other evidence-based (or no) smoking cessation aids."

### University of Paris 2021

Quote: "E-cigarette use was associated with smoking reduction and cessation attempt for individuals who have used it for less than one year and additional benefits are expected to occur with a longer duration of use."

## • Queen Mary University London 2021

Result: After six months, 19.1 percent of vapers were still smoke-free. In the NRT group, it was only 3.0 percent of the participants. Vaping can be 6x more successful in stopping tobacco than nicotine substitutes from the pharmacy.

## • <u>ASH UK 2021</u>

Quote: "Nearly two thirds of current vapers are ex-smokers (64.6%), and the proportion continues to grow, while the proportion who also smoke (known as dual users) has fallen to 30.5% in 2021."

## • Addictive Behaviors 2021 study Results

Quote: " Among adult daily cigarette smokers initially not planning to ever quit, subsequent daily e-cigarette use is associated with subsequent plans to quit smoking."

## <u>Roswell-Park study 2021</u>

Result: 28% of smokers quit smoking if they used e-cigarettes daily.

## <u>Australian study 2021</u>

Quote: "Daily, but not occasional, e-cigarette users were more likely to quit or reduce smoking cigarettes than Australian smokers who did not use e-cigarettes."

<u>New Zealand Study 2022</u>

Quote: "This modeling suggests that ENDS liberalization results in an expected gain of 195 000 quality-adjusted life-years (QALYs) over the remainder of the NZ population's lifespan."

# 3. Long-term studies

• University of Catania 2017 (3.5 years)

Result: Even in the case of heavy users of e-cigarettes, there is no evidence of incipient damage to the lungs and bronchi. No evidence of changes in subjects' blood pressure or heart rate.

- <u>University College London 2017</u> (6 months) Result: Significantly lower levels of carcinogens and toxins in long-term EC users compared to smokers and dual users.
- <u>Roswell Park study 2018</u> (10 months) Result: E-cigarette users showed 10% to 98% significantly lower concentrations of tobaccospecific biomarkers compared to cigarette smokers.
- <u>Action on Smoking and Health 2020</u> (8 years) Result: Since the start of the measurement in 2012, the number of e-cigarette users in the UK has increased from around 700,000 to 3.6 million in 2019. 99.7 percent of vapers are exsmokers.
- <u>Harvard Medical School 2020</u> (2 years) Result: Vaping can increase the likelihood of tobacco abstinence by 77 percent.
- <u>University of Catania 2020 (5 years)</u> Result: The use of e-cigarettes can improve objective and subjective COPD outcomes and the

improvements achieved can be maintained over the long term. Some of the damage caused by tobacco smoking in COPD patients can be mitigated in this way.

• <u>Long-term French study 2021</u> (2 years) Result: One-year use of e-cigarettes was associated with reduction in smoking and attempts to quit smoking. Additional benefits are expected to occur with longer periods of use.

# 4. Importance of flavors

Onassis Surgery Center 2013

Quote: "The results of this survey indicate that EC liquid flavourings play a major role in the overall experience of dedicated users and support the hypothesis that they are important contributors in reducing or eliminating smoking consumption. This should be considered by the health authorities."

 <u>University of Pittsburg 2015</u> Result: In contrast to adult smokers, non-smoking adolescents have very little interest in ecigarette flavors.

- <u>ZIS Hamburg 2016</u> Result: The majority of adult users consume fruit liquids (81 percent). Around half of those switching to use liquids with menthol or sweet flavors (cakes, pastries, etc.).
- <u>Seattle Public Health Center 2016</u> Quote: "The results suggest that flavours play an important role in e-cigarette preference and most likely use."
- <u>Virginia Commonwealth University 2016</u> Result: Reasons to use flavored e-liquids: Increased satisfaction and enjoyment, better taste than cigarettes, and variety of flavors.
- <u>Lexington-Department of Behavioral Science 2018</u> Quote: " Participants rated 'good taste' as the most important consideration when using and purchasing liquids."
- <u>University of Graz 2019</u> Result: Flavors do not cause damage to endothelium and vessels.
- <u>Public Health England 2020</u> Result: A ban on flavorings could have adverse effects and unintended consequences for smokers using e-cigarettes to quit smoking. It should only be viewed with caution.
- <u>Yale School of Public Health 2020</u> Result: Users of non-tobacco flavors are more likely to quit smoking than users of tobacco flavors.
- Penn State University College 2020
  Result: If all non-tobacco flavors were banned, a) 9.7% would return to tobacco cigarettes; b)
  19.2% find a way to get their flavored liquid or c) 32.8% mix their own liquids.
- <u>University of Michigan 2020</u>
  Result: Flavors are a criterion for vaping for just 5 percent of young people. Much more decisive are social factors (two thirds).
- ETHRA study 2020

Results: For around 70 percent of the German respondents, flavors were important or even very important when switching from smoking to vaping. More than a quarter would start smoking again or smoke more if all flavors except tobacco were banned.

• Yale School of Public Health 2021

Result: The likelihood of smoking conventional cigarettes has doubled among high school students in the San Francisco school district compared to trends in districts without the ban.

- <u>Auckland, New Zealand 2021</u>
  Result: 57% of respondents said they would circumvent a ban on popular e-liquid flavors by mixing their own e-liquid and/or buying e-liquid overseas or on the black market."
- <u>George Washington University 2021</u>
  Result: A third of respondents (33.2 percent) would switch to tobacco cigarettes if flavors were restricted. 39 percent would smoke again if e-cigarettes were completely banned.
- <u>Addictive Behaviors 2021</u> Result: 82 percent of the users surveyed are against flavor bans. One in six would start smoking again. Less than a third (28.8 percent) would be satisfied with the flavors that would then still be available. Almost as many (28.3 percent) say they would get their flavors in a different way.

• Prof. Mayer's report on the importance of menthol 2022

Quotes: "Menthol is not toxic when used normally in e-cigarettes. Its ban would reduce the attractiveness of vaping and in no way contribute to a reduction in smoking rates." "In view of the scientific facts, the Federal Council rejected the ban on menthol as a flavoring substance in e-liquids, which the Federal Government had already considered in 2016, and instead proposed a maximum quantity regulation. The facts have not changed since then." "There is no evidence of toxic or harmful effects of menthol. As a non-toxic substance, menthol is not listed under the EU's CLP regulation and is considered safe by the FDA."

<u>University of Illinois 2022</u>
 Result: ""Dual users who preferred sweet flavors were the most likely to quit smoking."

# 5. Adolescent use/ Gateway theory

## • ZIS Hamburg 2016

Result: 99 percent of the vapers are former (91.5%) or dual users (7.5%). Only 1 percent are never smokers

 <u>DEBRA study 2018</u> Result: In Germany, e-cigarettes are mainly used by current tobacco smokers (5.1%), to a lesser extent by ex-smokers (1.6%) and only by a very small number of never-smokers (0.3%).

• <u>Alternative Drug Report 2019</u> Quote: "Overall, statements on causal relationships in general and on the gateway hypothesis in particular could not be made on the basis of the current study situation to date."

- <u>University College London 2020</u> Result: Less than 1% of US youth who first use e-cigarettes went on to smoke.
- <u>Queensland Study 2021</u>
  Quote: "Results show little evidence that e-cigarette use is increasing cigarette smoking among US youth."
- University of Michigan and of Alabama 2021

Quote: "Among adolescent never cigarette smokers, those who had ever used e-cigarettes at baseline, compared with never e-cigarette users, exhibited modest or non-significant increases in subsequent past 12-month or past 30-day smoking when adjusting for behavioral risk factors."

## University College London 2022

Quote: " Prevalence of e-cigarette use among the youth population in England does not appear to be associated with substantial increases or decreases in the prevalence of smoking uptake."

## 6. Level of knowledge in the population

• Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR) 2020

Result: Only 6 percent of Germans are aware that e-cigarettes are significantly less harmful than tobacco.

- IFT Munich 2018 Result: Only a third of citizens in Germany know that e-cigarettes are significantly less harmful than tobacco.
- <u>Panel discussion on the e-cigarette 2020</u> Quote: "It would be better if one provided reasonable information and looked at what role the e-cigarette could have in smoking cessation compared to other methods that are clinically contained in the guidelines and are recommended there."
- <u>Position paper Stöver et al. 2020</u>
  Quote: "Public information about this significant risk reduction is poor, especially among smokers."
- <u>US study 2021</u>

Results: Adult cigarette smokers generally have misperceptions about the harms of nicotine and the relative risks of e-cigarettes.

- <u>Rutgers School of Public Health 2021</u>
  Quote: "Our findings demonstrate that question wording is important when measuring physician beliefs about nicotine. However, even after accounting for question version, misperceptions about the direct health effects of nicotine were common, and perceptions about nicotine varied by sex and specialty. Provider education about tobacco and nicotine should be prioritized in order to optimize patient–provider communications about tobacco use and cessation."
- Bristol University / University of Pennsylvania 2021

Quote: "These findings suggest that misinformation about e-cigarette harms may influence some adult smokers' decisions to consider using e-cigarettes."

• Office for Health Improvement and Disparities UK 2022

Quotes: "E-cigarettes are the most commonly used quit aid among smokers in England and there is growing evidence of their effectiveness. An updated Cochrane Review published in 2021 found that nicotine-containing e-cigarettes are around twice as effective in supporting smokers to quit as NRTs such as patches and gum." "Health and care professionals should provide to smokers on using e-cigarettes to quit."